

Exploring Gender-Based Analysis Plus in Impact Assessment

Three papers exploring GBA+ in Canada's Impact Assessment process

Funded by:

The Network for Expertise and Dialogue for Impact Assessment (NEDIA)

Social Science & Humanities Research Council (SSHRC)

Impact Assessment Agency of Canada (IACC)

Cole Atlin, PhD

catlin@atlinca.com

Amber Fletcher, PhD

Amber.fletcher@uregina.ca

Holly Campbell Gale, PhD Candidate

hollycampbellgale@gmail.com

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Legislative
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion



Nedia.ca

Impact Assessment Agency of Canada

<https://www.canada.ca/en/impact-assessment-agency.html>



Social Sciences and Humanities
Research Council of Canada

Conseil de recherches en
sciences humaines du Canada

Canada

<https://www.sshrc-crsh.gc.ca/>

This project is supported in part by funding from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council.

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Legislative
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Objectives

- To examine the structural forces and practical limitations affecting the implementation of GBA+ analysis in the Canadian IA sector.
- To develop practical outputs to facilitate GBA+ in the IA sector.

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- **Overview**
- Legislative
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Three papers:

- Legislative: GBA+ in IAA
- Empirical: GBA+ in past IAs
- Theoretical: GBA+ and SA

Methodology

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- **Legislative**
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

- How were gender and GBA+ represented during the legislative development of IAA?
- Feminist Content Analysis + Critical Frame Analysis (CFA)
 - Quantitative count of gender-related keywords
 - Qualitative CFA to examine discourses about gender/GBA+ in 1st, 2nd, 3rd readings by House of Commons and Senate

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- **Legislative**
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Number of Excerpts Per Keyword

Keyword	Number of Excerpts
Gender	51
Women	44
Woman	14
GBA	8
GBA+	4
Female	3
Girl	2
Non-Binary	2
Queer	0
Transgender	0
Total	127

Findings

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- **Legislative**
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Frame 1: What is the Appropriate Scope for IA?

Opponents:

- GBA+ is beyond the scope of IA
- Binary discourses: GBA+ as "subjective" while IA is "objective"; GBA+ as "social" while IA is "technical"

Advocates:

- GBA+ is a welcome expansion of scope
- impacts of IA are social; therefore, social analysis needed

Findings

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- **Legislative**
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Frame 2: Equality and Vulnerability

Opponents:

- GBA+ requirement represents men negatively; therefore, not equal
- GBA+ requirement ignores existent gender equality efforts in industry

Advocates:

- GBA+ identifies differential impacts and vulnerabilities – particularly women's vulnerability
- occasional instrumentalist approach: "better to work together [...] than be litigating"

Preliminary Conclusions

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- **Legislative**
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Discourse of GBA+ in IA legislation was marked by confusion, uncertainty, lack of clarity

- Opponents argued this was insurmountable
- Advocates called for resources and guidelines

Representation of women (especially Indigenous women) as vulnerable, victims

- Less attention to their knowledge, agency, leadership

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Legislative
- **Empirical**
- Theoretical
- Discussion

- Challenge to “lack of clarify/precedent” claim

- How was GBA+ considered during past Environmental Assessment cases?

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Legislative
- **Empirical**
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Five Sustainability Assessment cases:

- Mackenzie Valley Pipeline Inquiry, 1977
- Voisey's Bay Mine and Mill Environmental Assessment, 1997
- Whites Point Quarry and Marine Terminal Project, 2005
- Mackenzie Gas Project, 2009
- Lower Churchill Hydroelectric Generation Project Nalcor Energy Newfoundland and Labrador, 2011

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Legislative
- **Empirical**
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Document	page number	section/chapter/heading	keyword count	summary of passage(s)	Relevance to GBA+	Potential codes
Keywords: gender, women, woman, girl, female, queer, gay, lesbian, LGBT, trans, two-spirit						
	601	Table 19-9 Key Issues — Equity Impacts	gender (2)	Gender Equity: "The Project with recommended diversity planning could reduce gender inequities sufficiently to make	4	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity
	607	Chapter 19 -- 19.6: Summary of Panel Analysis of the Five Key	women (1)	"Attention to the distribution of Project opportunities and economic benefits would build confidence in the fairness of arrangements for sharing resources and	4	benefits of project for women
	609	Chapter 19 -- 19.7: Evaluation of the project's contribution to	women (1)	"Implementation of the Panel's recommendations would enhance Project-related training opportunities for the improvement of labour force capacity in the NWT and	4	benefits of project for women
	630	Appendix 2: Biographies of Joint Review Panel Members	woman (1) women (2)	"Ms. Dolphus was the first woman Mayor of Deline" and "President of the Native Women's Association of the Northwest Territories, and Vice President of Native	2	title
8 Lower Churchill Hydroelectric Generation Project Nalcor Energy Newfoundland and Labrador, 2011						
Report of the Joint Review Panel - Lower Churchill (Muskat falls) Hydroelectric Generation Project, Nalcor Energy, Newfoundland and Labrador	xxvii	Executive Summary -- Family and community life, and public	women (1)	"The Panel was not provided with baseline data regarding the existing levels of alcohol and drug abuse and related sexual assault and family violence in Happy	4	domestic violence / impact of increased presence of alcohol
	xxviii	Executive Summary -- Family and community life, and public	women (2)	"The Panel concluded that there is the potential for adverse effects resulting from high wage employment, including increased substance abuse, and sexual assault,	5	domestic violence / impact of increased presence of alcohol
	xxix	Executive Summary -- Family and community life, and public	women (1)	"The consumption of country food contaminated with methylmercury poses risks to human health, particularly in pregnant women and young children. Consumption	4	negative health impacts
	4	Introduction -- 1.4: Involvement of Interested Parties -- 1.4.2:	women (1)	"The Canadian Environmental Assessment Agency established Funding Review Committees, independent from the Panel, to review funding applications and to	3	Involved stakeholders
	200	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	gender (1) women (1)	"Prior to Project sanction, Nalcor would develop and implement a Gender Equity Program and a Diversity Program for all Project activities in the province, for both	5	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity
	201	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	gender (2) women (5)	"The preliminary objectives and strategies identified to ensure gender equity and diversity in the Project workforce are reflected in Nalcor's mitigation and monitoring	5	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity
	202	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	gender (1)	Nalcor's proposal of business opportunities include collecting data on employee demographic information, including gender	3	data collection on gender
	203	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	gender (2) women (6)	Nalcor's proposal further includes: "-implement progressive hiring, promotion, and mentoring practices for women;	5	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity
	204	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	women (1)	"The Department of Education indicated that the Province was actively trying to encourage more young women to work in the trades area through programs such	4	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity
	205	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	gender (12) women (15)	Stakeholders advocate that current equity plans proposed by Nalcor are insufficient, and express concerns that any proposed plans will not be adequately	5	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity
	206	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	women (1)	Continuation of stakeholder proposals for better inclusion of women in project strategies--in this case, hiring more women.	4	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity
	207	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	women (1)	"The Nunatsiavut Government and the AngajukKâk of Nain indicated that, all too often, people who live closest to the various training programs are those who	4	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity
	208	Chapter 12 -- 12.2: Employment and business opportunities --	gender (1)	"In reaching its conclusions on maximizing the benefits from employment and business	5	recommendations for supporting women / gender equity

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Legislative
- **Empirical**
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Preliminary codes and themes:

- Concerns about impacts of worker influx
 - alcohol
 - sexual assault / unwanted pregnancies
 - disruption of local culture
- Equitable employment
- Secondary impacts
- Recommendations in the SA Cases

Outline

- Sponsors
 - Initial proposal
 - Overview
 - Legislative
 - Empirical
 - **Theoretical**
 - Discussion
- **Review of SA**
 - **Proposed integration of GBA+**
 - **Application to case study: Ring of Fire**
 - **Expanded sustainability criteria for explicit gender consideration**
 - **Identified the need to explicitly consider gender in over 50% of identified criteria**

Outline

- Sponsors
 - Initial proposal
 - Overview
 - Legislative
 - Empirical
 - **Theoretical**
 - Discussion
- **Methodology- Eabametoong well-being indicators form basis of sustainability criteria**
 - **Expand appropriate criteria to include gender specific concerns**
 - **Ask question, does this criteria specifically influence 2SLGBTQIA+/ women/ girls?
*hint it likely does**

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Legislative
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

EFN Category	Sub-categories	Criteria/ Questions <u>The * refers to criteria without pre-existing baseline data</u>	Gender Considerations
1. Improving <u>Community Wellbeing</u> <u>Standard Sustainability Characteristics include:</u> - <u>Livelihood Sufficiency and Opportunity</u> - <u>Socio-ecological Civility and Democratic Governance</u>	1. Livelihood sufficiency and opportunity	b. Would this option increase the availability of employment options within EFN?	Would this option increase employment options for women and 2SLGBT+? Would it increase employment options for women and 2SLGBTQ+ in non-traditional roles? Would it increase union and trade jobs for women and 2SLGBTQ+?
	Economic Stratification/ Equity	c. Would this option improve local economic conditions in EFN?	Would women and 2SLGBTQ+ benefit as much as men economically?
	Economic Diversification	e. Would this option increase the proportion of members employed part-time?	Part-time employment is particularly important for women, whom often have familial responsibilities
	Small Business/ Indigenous Owned Business Expansion	g. Would this option increase the proportion of members employed in management or leadership positions?	Would this option increase the number of women and 2SLGBTQ+ in management or leadership roles?
		h. Would this option increase the proportion of members employed in indigenous owned business or partnership?	Would this option increase the proportion of women employed in indigenous owned business or partnership? Would it increase indigenous women and 2SLGBTQ+ entrepreneurship?
		i. Would this option increase the proportion of members employed in local band administration or other public service?	Would this option increase the proportion of women and 2SLGBTQ+ employed in local band administration?
		j. Would this option increase the proportion of members employed in mineral exploration, support service, or mine-related company?	Would this option increase the proportion of women & 2SLGBTQ+ members employed in mineral exploration, support service, or mine-related company?
		k. Would this option decrease economic stratification in the community?*	How could this stratification impact women and 2SLGBTQ+?
	2. Social Life and Interaction	a. Would the option increase participation in faith-based activities? Local spiritual groups? Spiritual connection with land? Participation in dances? Community sports and other games? Community events? Fundraising and other charitable events? Sharing country foods and resources? Membership in community groups?	Women frequently are leaders in community events, spiritual events, and charitable undertakings. Outlining the role that women have in these events and the benefits or impacts to their participation would need to be considered for effective GBA+ considerations.
	3. Community Health	a. Would the option positively impact the cost of food?	Food insecurity is particular problematic for mothers and those with young families to care for. Determining the impact of the cost of food is critical for determining gendered impacts.
		b. Would the option positively impact the quality of traditional food? Decrease consumption and reliance on store bought foods? Increase reliance and consumption of traditional foods?	The preparation of country foods is often the responsibility of women.
		e. Would the option impact the presence of lifestyle illnesses? . Would the option decrease the likelihood of lifestyle illnesses?	The burden of care for the sick and elderly often falls to women. Determining if any undertaking would have positive effects on lifestyle illness would impact women.
		g. Would the option decrease access to drugs and alcohol? Decrease prevalence?	Drug and alcohol usage is linked to violence against women, children and 2SLGBTQ+ peoples. An undertaking's influence on access and prevalence of drugs and alcohol has a direct impact on women
		j. Would the option decrease the prevalence of mental health issues? Improve overall mental health?	Mental health issues for women and 2SLGBTQ+ are significant and often manifest differently than in cis-gender men.

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Paper 1
- Paper 2
- Paper 3
- Discussion

What do these collective findings tell us about the future of GBA+ in IA?

Unlike what the Senate implied, we do have experience with GBA+

**Gender is generally myopically considered in assessment:
Workers or Victims of Violence**

Broad spectrum impacts to 2SLGBTQIA+, women and girls necessary, with increased nuance

Outline

- Sponsors
- Initial proposal
- Overview
- Legislative
- Empirical
- Theoretical
- Discussion

Thank you!

Funded by:
The Network for Expertise and Dialogue for Impact
Assessment (NEDIA)
Social Science & Humanities Research Council (SSHRC)

Cole Atlin, PhD
catlin@atlinca.com
Amber Fletcher, PhD
Amber.fletcher@uregina.ca
Holly Campbell Gale, PhD Candidate
hollycampbellgale@gmail.com