**OAIA Annual Conference 2013** 

## Science & the Natural Environment Under the Renewable Energy Approvals Process



ERIC K. GILLESPIE PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

BARRISTERS & SOLICITORS

### **The REA Approval Process**

#### **Pre- Submission**

Construction Plan Report Consultation Reports

 Communities (public meetings); Aboriginal Communities; Local Roads & Services Decommissioning Plan Report Design & Operations Report If required

 Archeological Assessment; Protected Properties; Heritage Assessment Natural Heritage Assessment
Water Assessment

Wind Turbine Specifications Report

#### **Application Complete**

Completed reports are accepted by the MOE Posted on Environmental Registry 6 month "Service Guarantee"

#### **REA Approval**

Notice is posted to the Environmental Registry

EKG

## The REA Appeal Process

#### Strict, short time lines

Appeal - 15 days after notice of decision

From the date of commencement of appeal, you must, within:

- 3 weeks First Disclosure
- 4 weeks Preliminary Hearing
- 5.5 weeks Second Disclosure
- 6.5 weeks Replies
- 8 weeks Hearing starts

The tribunal must release a decision within 6 months after receipt of the Appeal Notice.



## The Appeal Test EPA s.142.1(3)

• Serious Harm To Human Health

• SERIOUS & IRREVERSIBLE HARM TO PLANT LIFE, ANIMAL LIFE OR THE NATURAL ENVIRONMENT



## REA Appeals on Environmental Grounds

- Monture v. Director, MOE, [2012] O.E.R.T.D. No. 12 (QL)
- Haldimand Wind Concerns v. Director, MOE, [2013] O.E.R.T.D. No.12 (QL)
- Prince Edward County Field Naturalists v. Director, MOE, [2013] O.E.R.T.D. No. 40 (QL) ("PECFN")

## **PECFN:**

### Evidence presented to the ERT submitted that IWTs had the potential to cause

# SERIOUS & IRREVERSIBLE HARM TO:

# **Alvar Ecosystem**



Whip-poor-will



**Purple Martin** 



Saw-Whet Owl

**Birds** 











### Monarch Butterfly







## **Blanding's Turtle**





## **Road Structures**





### **PECFN Decision**

"The Tribunal finds that mortality due to roads, brought by increased vehicle traffic, poachers and predators, directly in the habitat of Blanding's turtle, a species that is globally endangered and threatened in Ontario, is serious and irreversible harm to Blanding's turtle at Ostrander Point Crown Land Block that will not be effectively mitigated by the conditions in the REA." (para 363 of ERT decision)

#### January 20 - 23, 2014 Osgoode Hall – Ontario Divisional Court PECFN Appeal





ERIC K. GILLESPIE PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

BARRISTERS & SOLICITORS

10 King Street East 6<sup>th</sup> Floor Toronto, ON M5C 1C3

Eric Gillespie Direct: 416-703-6362 egillespie@gillespielaw.ca